

## YOU WERE NOT FIRED, YOU DECIDED TO RETIRE

In the case of Green v Hartog (C88/2016) [2017] ZALCCT 40 (5 September 2017), the employee approached the Labour Court alleging that she was dismissed because of her age. She argued that there was no agreed retirement age and that her "dismissal", when she was 56 years old, was automatically unfair.



# YOU WERE NOT FIRED, YOU DECIDED TO RETIRE

The employee claimed that she was given a letter of termination stating that she had reached her retirement age.

Her employer argued that he discussed the employee's poor work performance and absenteeism with her and suggested that she retire instead of facing a disciplinary process.



In the case of *Green v Hartog* (C88/2016) [2017] ZALCCT 40 (5 September 2017), the employee approached the Labour Court alleging that she was dismissed because of her age. She argued that there was no agreed retirement age and that her "dismissal", when she was 56 years old, was automatically unfair.

The employee claimed that she was given a letter of termination stating that she had reached her retirement age. She also argued that her contract did not contain a clause pertaining to the retirement age. Her case was that the employer "dishonestly inserted a retirement age into the contract she signed."

Her employer, on the other hand, argued that he discussed the employee's poor work performance and absenteeism with her and suggested that she retire instead of facing a disciplinary process. The employer alleged that she accepted the option of retirement.

Although, the employee's initial employment contract did not contain a retirement age, the employer argued that the employee together with other employees signed an amended contract that included a retirement age of 55. The employer also gave evidence that the employees signed the amended contracts in each other's presence and that they signed as each other's witnesses.

The Labour Court considered the conflicting evidence regarding whether there was an agreement to retire. It held that the employee's version that she did not sign the amended contract in the presence of the other employees was improbable and that, in the Court's view "cast doubt on the veracity of [the employee's] evidence as a whole..."

The Court held that "[i]t is common cause that she signed the final version of the contract and initialled it on every page. She therefore expressly indicated her acceptance of the terms on each page.

Our courts have made it clear that a person will not escape the consequences of her signature if they have not read the document in question. One is expected to read what one signs."

The Court found that the employee knew what she was signing and signed the contract with full knowledge that it contained a clause with a retirement age.

In dealing with whether the employee was dismissed, the Court considered the employer's evidence that the employee was given repeated warnings over a number of years and given this history, the employer's evidence was more probable that the employee agreed to retire after she was called into a meeting about her conduct and performance and given the option of retiring or submitting to a disciplinary process.

The Court found that the employee's credibility was undermined by her version that she did not sign the amended agreement together with the other employees.

The Labour Court found that on a balance of probabilities the employee was not dismissed. It agreed with the employer that the employee agreed to resign instead of facing disciplinary action. As there was no dismissal, the Court did not need to determine the question of an automatically unfair dismissal. The employee's claim was dismissed with costs.

Thabang Rapuleng





Find out what steps an employer can take when striking employees ignore court orders.



CHAMBERS GLOBAL 2014 - 2017 ranks our Employment practice in Band 2: Employment.

Aadil Patel ranked by CHAMBERS GLOBAL 2015 - 2017 in Band 2: Employment.

Hugo Pienaar ranked by CHAMBERS GLOBAL 2014 - 2017 in Band 2: Employment.

Fiona Leppan ranked by CHAMBERS GLOBAL 2017 in Band 3: Employment.

Gillian Lumb ranked by CHAMBERS GLOBAL 2017 in Band 4: Employment.



Michael Yeates named winner in the **2015** and **2016 ILO Client Choice International Awards** in the category 'Employment and Benefits, South Africa'.











### **OUR TEAM**

For more information about our Employment practice and services, please contact:



**Aadil Patel** National Practice Head Director T +27 (0)11 562 1107



**Thabang Rapuleng** +27 (0)11 562 1759 E thabang.rapuleng@cdhlegal.com

Samiksha Singh



T +27 (0) 21 481 6341 E steven.adams@cdhlegal.com



Gillian Lumb Regional Practice Head Director T +27 (0)21 481 6315





T +27 (0)21 481 6314 E samiksha.singh@cdhlegal.com **Gavin Stansfield** 



Samantha Bonato T +27 (0)11 562 1134 E samantha.bonato@cdhlegal.com



**Kirsten Caddy** T +27 (0)11 562 1412 E kirsten.caddy@cdhlegal.com



T +27 (0)21 481 6313 E gavin.stansfield@cdhlegal.com



Sean Jamieson T +27 (0)11 562 1296 E sean.jamieson@cdhlegal.com



Director T +27 (0)21 481 6319 E jose.jorge@cdhlegal.com

Jose Jorge

Fiona Leppan

**Hugo Pienaar** 



Michael Yeates Director T +27 (0)11 562 1184 E michael.yeates@cdhlegal.com



Zola Mcaciso Associate T +27 (0)21 481 6316 E zola.mcaciso@cdhlegal.com



Director T +27 (0)11 562 1152 E fiona.leppan@cdhlegal.com



Ndumiso Zwane Director T +27 (0)11 562 1231 E ndumiso.zwane@cdhlegal.com



Anelisa Mkeme Associate T +27 (0)11 562 1039 E anelisa.mkeme@cdhlegal.com



Directo T +27 (0)11 562 1350 E hugo.pienaar@cdhlegal.com



Senior Associate +27 (0)21 481 6351 E anli.bezuidenhout@cdhlegal.com

Anli Bezuidenhout



Prinoleen Naidoo Associate +27 (0)11 562 1829 E prinoleen.naidoo@cdhlegal.com



Nicholas Preston Director T +27 (0)11 562 1788 E nicholas.preston@cdhlegal.com



Bheki Nhlapho Associate T +27 (0)11 562 1568 E bheki.nhlapho@cdhlegal.com

#### **BBBEE STATUS:** LEVEL THREE CONTRIBUTOR

Cliffe Dekker Hofmeyr is very pleased to have achieved a Level 3 BBBEE verification under the new BBBEE Codes of Good Practice. Our BBBEE verification is one of several components of our transformation strategy and we continue to seek ways of improving it in a meaningful manner.

This information is published for general information purposes and is not intended to constitute legal advice. Specialist legal advice should always be sought in relation to any particular situation. Cliffe Dekker Hofmeyr will accept no responsibility for any actions taken or not taken on the basis of this publication.

#### **JOHANNESBURG**

1 Protea Place, Sandton, Johannesburg, 2196. Private Bag X40, Benmore, 2010, South Africa. Dx 154 Randburg and Dx 42 Johannesburg. T +27 (0)11 562 1000 F +27 (0)11 562 1111 E jhb@cdhlegal.com

11 Buitengracht Street, Cape Town, 8001. PO Box 695, Cape Town, 8000, South Africa. Dx 5 Cape Town. T +27 (0)21 481 6300 F +27 (0)21 481 6388 E ctn@cdhlegal.com

©2017 1904/SEPT













